

Historic Preservation Commission
October 15, 2019 Meeting Minutes

A. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m.

B. Roll Call

Present: Chair Sharon Whitaker, Vice-Chair Pamela Sue Anderson, Commissioner Patti Jordan, Commissioner Richard Parson, Commissioner Tina Steiner, and Commissioner Andrew Wolfe

Absent: Commissioner Shirley Marquardt,

Staff present: Principal Planner Joelle Jordan, PDS Assistant Director Bradley Dushkin, and Planning Tech Kerstin Harding

C. Citizen Communication

There were no citizens wishing to speak during this agenda item.

D. Approval of Minutes

D.1 Consider approval of the minutes of the August 20, 2019 Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Motion: by Commissioner Jordan and Second by Vice-Chair Anderson to approve the minutes of the August 20, 2019 HPC meeting as presented.

Vote: Aye: Chair Whitaker, Vice-Chair Anderson, Commissioner Jordan, Commissioner Parson, Commissioner Steiner, and Commissioner Wolfe. Nay: none. The vote was 6-0.

D.2 Consider approval of the minutes of the September 17, 2019 Historic Preservation Commission Work Session.

Motion: by Vice-Chair Anderson and Second by Commissioner Wolfe to approve the minutes of the September 17, 2019 HPC meeting as presented.

Vote: Aye: Chair Whitaker, Vice-Chair Anderson, Commissioner Jordan, Commissioner Parson, Commissioner Steiner, and Commissioner Wolfe. Nay: none. The vote was 6-0.

E. Certificate of Appropriateness

E.1 Consider an action regarding a Certificate of Appropriateness application for 104 S. Georgetown Avenue.

Principal Planner Joelle Jordan gave a brief history of the property and explained that the request was for a 12-ft. wide roll-up garage door on the south side of the new freestanding garage. Planning Tech Kerstin Harding briefly summarized how the request was part of a larger project and explained the review history. A Certificate of Appropriateness (CofA) was issued by the HPC in August 2018 for a rear addition to the historic home and for a new freestanding garage with a roof deck. Although the garage would be at the south end of the lot by Bagdad Ave., the door would face the alley to the north, even though this would require the driveway to extend all the way across the back of the lot to the alley.

In July the owner requested an administrative CofA for a 10-ft wide garage door on the south side, facing Bagdad. The proposed doors were described as 5-ft. by 8-ft. hinged wooden doors. It was decided that staff could review the request instead of the HPC because it was not part of the historic structure, and the request was approved with the condition that the final door selection would first be approved by staff.

The second door selection was a metal roll-up door with imitation wood embossed planks and decorative hinges. Staff approved the doors and confirmed over email that these were hinged doors but did not clarify that the hinges were decorative rather than functional. On October 2, 2019 an

amendment to the CofA was issued allowing the width to be increased from 10 ft. to 12 ft. The applicant submitted a wider version of the second door whose hinges were obviously non-functional because the door had three vertical sections, and staff denied it. The applicant's request at the October 15, 2019 meeting was to request a roll-up garage door for the 12-ft opening.

Assistant Director Bradley Dushkin took the podium to explain the intent of the MU-L (Mixed-use Limited) zoning district. The downtown Mixed-use zoning districts were adopted in 2013 as a means to improve the pedestrian experience by de-emphasizing parking, minimize the number of curb cuts, and orient vehicle entrances to the alleys instead of the curb, as they traditionally would have been. This is codified in the Zoning and Development Code sections 2-73 (d) (1). Although the applicant claims the garage door will not be used for vehicle access, staff believes that a door designed for vehicles makes for a more vehicle-oriented streetscape.

Ms. Jordan clarified that the request would use the CofA to override the requirement of the MU-L ordinance that garages must be oriented toward an alley. In order to override the zoning requirement, the HPC must find that the 12-ft roll-up door on the south side of the garage is *more* historically appropriate than other openings and types of doors. Staff recommended that the vehicle entrance on the south side violates the requirement of the MU-L district that garages are to be oriented to an alley. The improvements on Bagdad mean that a curb cut and driveway on the south side will never be permitted, and since there will not be vehicle access there is no reason to have a vehicle door. There are many other types of doors that provide adequate ventilation.

Applicant Erik Schaeffer took the podium to answer questions about his request. He explained that he wanted to make the garage into a workshop and home gym with through ventilation. He said that the driveway to the garage will be on the north side and to him that makes it oriented to the alley.

Commissioner Jordan asked whether he had considered other types of doors and Mr. Schaeffer explained that hinged doors were too heavy, especially in wind, and sliding barn doors did not keep the weather out adequately. Commissioner Wolfe asked whether the property was fenced on the south side, and whether a curb cut would ever be allowed on the south side. Mr. Schaeffer replied that there would be a 4-ft. wrought iron fence and Assistant Director Dushkin replied that the Transportation Department would not allow curb cuts. Vice-Chair Anderson said that if the door looked like a barn door it should open like a barn door, rather than roll-up.

Motion: by Vice-Chair Anderson to accept the 12-ft opening, deny the 12-ft roll-up door, and have staff approve a hinged, bifold or barn door. There was no second.

Motion: by Commissioner Wolfe and Second by Commissioner Jordan to approve the 12-ft opening and a 12-ft roll-up door with two vertical panels that appear to be a pair of hinged doors.

Motion amended by Commissioner Wolfe that staff approve the final door selection, and that the image provided would closely match door selected by the homeowner and the door earlier approved by staff. Material to be metal with a wood grain and hardware as per the provided picture, painted white, and with final approval by staff. Commissioner Jordan seconded the amended motion.

Vote: Aye: Commissioner Jordan, Commissioner Parson, Commissioner Steiner, and Commissioner Wolfe. Nay: Chair Whitaker and Vice-Chair Anderson. The vote was 4-2.

E.2 Consider an action regarding a Certificate of Appropriateness application for 607 E. Main Street.

Ms. Jordan gave a brief history of the house, noting that it had been vacant for about 10 years before it was purchased in 2016. In December 2016 the HPC issued a CofA for restoration of the existing house and a large, two-story addition behind it. that CofA had conditioned that the addition would have wood 2-over-2 windows and wood or composite doors, with the specific models to be reviewed by staff before ordering.

When the applicant applied for a building permit in February 2019 the door and window schedules indicated wood 2-over-2 windows and two types of wood doors but did not provide model #s. Preservation staff reviewed the building permit and sent a letter to the contractor listing items that still required staff review per the 2016 CofA.

Construction has progressed, and a recent site visit noted 2-over-2 aluminum windows with muntins between layers of glass had been installed, as had steel doors with pressed imitation panels. The applicant requests a CofA for the windows and doors that have been installed.

Staff believes that the installed doors are far from the conditions in the CofA and the descriptions in the building permit application. She noted that grid-between-glass windows are specifically

prohibited in the City's *Residential Design Guidelines*. Staff recommended replacing the doors and finding a way to modify the windows.

The applicant, contractor Danny Pullen, came to the podium to answer questions. He said that he had not received a letter regarding the CofA requirements in February, and the original CofA had been sent to the architect in 2016. He said that removing and replacing all the doors and windows on the addition would cost him in the neighborhood of \$30k-40k. Mr. Pullen planned to make full window screens for the historic section of the house and suggested that he make custom screens for the addition also.

Motion: by Commissioner Wolfe and Second by Vice-Chair Anderson that all the windows that could have been replaced be covered with full screens with painted muntins; that single doors be made of wood, fiberglass or composite with no more than a half-light in a pattern that reflects the historic structure, along with the double doors to be $\frac{3}{4}$ to full light in a pattern that reflects the historic structure as well, and to be painted at the staff's discretion.

Vote: Aye: Chair Whitaker, Vice-Chair Anderson, Commissioner Jordan, Commissioner Parson, Commissioner Steiner, and Commissioner Wolfe. Nay: none. The vote was 6-0.

F. Presentations

F.1 Consider a presentation regarding the development of the Historic Preservation Commission's 2019-2020 goals.

The Commissioners reviewed the draft 2019-2020 goals for the Historic Preservation Commission, and Principal Planner Joelle Jordan made notes. The Commission felt it was not ready to adopt the goals, so it decided to table their adoption until the next meeting.

Motion: by Commissioner Wolfe and Second by Commissioner Parson to table adoption of the Historic Preservation Commission's 2019-2020 goals until the next HPC meeting.

Vote: Aye: Chair Whitaker, Vice-Chair Anderson, Commissioner Jordan, Commissioner Parson, Commissioner Steiner, and Commissioner Wolfe. Nay: none. The vote was 6-0.

G. Staff Report

G.1 Consider an update regarding a draft of the City's 2030 Historic Preservation Plan.

Ms. Jordan said that before voting on the Preservation Plan there would be a public hearing at the November meeting. To give the Commissioners extra time to consider the plan the draft will be distributed two weeks before the meeting.

G.2 Consider an update regarding the 2019 Local Legend Awards.

Ms. Jordan noted that the 2019 Local Legend Awards would be presented at the November 14 City Council meeting and asked that they attend.

H. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 7:37 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,


Kerstin Harding
Planning Technician